

DECISION/DIRECTION NOTE

Title: Metal Roofs in Heritage Areas

Date Prepared: August 26, 2020

Report To: Committee of the Whole

Councillor and Role: Councillor Maggie Burton, Planning & Development

Ward: N/A

Decision/Direction Required:

To review the metal roof standards recommended by the Built Heritage Experts Panel.

Discussion – Background and Current Status:

At its April 18, 2019, meeting, the Built Heritage Experts Panel (BHEP) discussed options for energy-efficient retrofits on buildings in the St. John's Heritage Areas, specifically the use of metal roofs and solar panels. As older buildings are renovated, residents and property owners are looking for ways to increase energy efficiency. The City seeks to strike a balance between preserving the heritage and character-defining elements of buildings and allowing renovations to make buildings more energy-efficient.

At the time, the BHEP discussed various types of metal roofs and solar panels and made a recommendation to Council. At the May 1, 2019 Committee of the Whole meeting, the Committee had questions and referred the matter back to the BHEP for clarification. The subject was reviewed again at the June 12, 2019 BHEP meeting and the BHEP made the following recommendation:

That the following apply to the use of modern roof materials in heritage areas:

- Shingle-style metal roofs for residential dwellings will be permitted subject to the material replicating heritage style. Non-residential buildings may be permitted other styles of metal roofs if the style replicates the existing roof style.
- Solar Panels will be permitted as long as they are not visible from the street.

The Decision Note for this recommendation is attached for your reference. Council accepted the recommendation. The BHEP's recommendation has been used to provide guidance to anyone wishing to install a metal roof or solar panels in a Heritage Area and will be incorporated into the new Heritage By-law.

The City has received a request from a property owner to consider more than shingle-style metal roofs on residential buildings; see the attached memo. The owner would like to replace scalloped shingles on a mansard roof with a batten-seam metal roof. They claim that batten-seam metal is the only heritage-appropriate, visually attractive, long-lasting, and achievable solution for their mansard repair. To date, an application for renovations at the subject property has not been received. The property was used as an example during the BHEP discussion of

ST. JOHN'S

this topic. The BHEP reviewed all the examples provided by the resident and did not agree with the viewpoint that batten-seam metal roofs are appropriate on mansard roofs in St. John's. The Panel stand by their recommendation from 2019. Staff agree with this recommendation.

Key Considerations/Implications:

1. Budget/Financial Implications: Not applicable.
2. Partners or Other Stakeholders: Residents and property owners in the Heritage Areas; heritage groups.
3. Alignment with Strategic Directions/Adopted Plans:
St. John's Strategic Plan 2019-2029 – A Sustainable City – Plan for land use and preserve and enhance the natural and built environment where we live
4. Legal or Policy Implications: The heritage policies of the St. John's Municipal Plan and heritage standards of the St. John's Development Regulations, and the upcoming Heritage By-law.
5. Privacy Implications: Not applicable.
6. Engagement and Communications Considerations: If changes are made by Council, these will be publicized.
7. Human Resource Implications: Not applicable.
8. Procurement Implications: Not applicable.
9. Information Technology Implications: Not applicable.
10. Other Implications: Not applicable.

Recommendation:

That Council reject the assertion that a batten-seam roof is the most appropriate material to use on residential buildings in Heritage Areas and stand by its position of 2019 as follows:

That the following apply to the use of modern roof materials in heritage areas:

- Shingle-style metal roofs for residential dwellings will be permitted subject to the material replicating heritage style. Non-residential buildings may be permit other styles of metal roofs if the style replicates the existing roof style.

Prepared by: Ann-Marie Cashin, MCIP, Planner III – Urban Design Heritage

Approved by: Ken O'Brien, MCIP, Chief Municipal Planner

Report Approval Details

Document Title:	Metal Roofs in Heritage Areas (COTW).docx
Attachments:	- Metal Roofs in Heritage Areas - Attachment.pdf
Final Approval Date:	Aug 26, 2020

This report and all of its attachments were approved and signed as outlined below:

Ken O'Brien - Aug 26, 2020 - 3:15 PM

Jason Sinyard - Aug 26, 2020 - 3:38 PM