

ST. JOHN'S

Minutes of Built Heritage Experts Panel

May 13, 2020
12:00 p.m.
Virtual

Present: Glenn Barnes, Chairperson
Bruce Blackwood, Contractor
Garnet Kindervater, Contractor
Dawn Boutilier, Planner
Rachel Fitkowski, Landscape Architect
Mark Whalen, Architecture
Ken O'Brien, Chief Municipal Planner
Ann Marie Cashin, Heritage and Urban Planner
Rob Schamper, Technical Advisor

Staff: Maureen Harvey, Legislative Assistant

2. APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA

Recommendation

Moved By Rachel Fitkowski

Seconded By Bruce Blackwood

That the agenda be adopted with the addition of a report from Rachel Fitkowski re: sidewalk snowclearing public engagement session.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

3. PRESENTATIONS/DELEGATIONS

3.1 150 New Gower Street, MPA1800003

The Panel welcomed a delegation for the application consisting of Eva Mataj of Mataj Architects and Jessica Stanford of Lat 49 Architecture Inc.

who highlighted changes from the previous iteration of the design presented at a previous meeting of the Panel.

Following the departure of the delegation discussion took place with the Panel in agreement as follows:

- a. consideration ought to be given to the overall building scale for commercial downtown St. John's
- b. consideration of shop front windows and inset alcoves.
- c. consideration of ground level/shop level pedestrian scale definitions and elements

An image of the former London New York and Paris will be forwarded to the applicant to demonstrate a preferred design.

3.2 68 Queen's Road, MPA1900002

The Panel welcomed Philip Pratt, Rick Pardy and Paul Chafe to the meeting and commended the group on the extensive consultation that had taken place since the last meeting of the Panel resulting in a number of proposed changes.

Discussion took place with the following comments noteworthy:

- a. consideration of the retention of trees along Queen's Road where possible
- b. a stronger commitment to preserve, retain and use the existing arch in the new design. The Panel is not agreeable to demolition of the arch simply for the purpose of reducing cost. The original materials of the archway to be incorporated into the new design as in the original arrangement. Otherwise the arch to remain in its current location.
- c. the proposed inclusion of a small interpretive sculptural arch to the right of the townhouse could be more appropriately repositioned to mitigate potential damage. The current location could be prone to destruction by vehicles or plows.
- d. The Harvey Road façade could incorporate some of the elements from the townhouse building, such as the cruciform (cross-shaped) window style.

Following the departure of the delegation, staff confirmed that the recommendations will be sent back to the proponent for revisions to the LUAR.

The Panel then discussed the new Envision Development Regulations noting that the processing of this application should set an example for a new process as, in future, consultation will be required prior to the submission of a LUAR. The Panel agreed this will be a progressive step going forward.

Recognizing that once the design is approved at the Land Use Assessment stage, the Panel will need to decide whether to recommend the removal of heritage designation. The Panel expressed concern that if the designation is removed, the Panel's suggestions may not be incorporated. i.e. windows, archway, signage etc.

The Panel was also informed that there is some assertion among heritage activists that the Parish Hall is considered part of a national ecclesiastical heritage district and as such is a National Historic Site. However, this is contrary to the position of Parks Canada. The existing building is not in itself a National Historic Site.

4. NEW BUSINESS

4.1 5 Church Hill, Roof Deck

The City has received an application for a roof deck, located at the rear of the dwelling at 5 Church Hill. The subject property is located within Heritage Area 1, the Commercial Downtown District of the St. John's Municipal Plan and is zoned Commercial Central Mixed Use (CCM). The building is not designated by Council as a Heritage Building.

As per Section 5.9.4 Heritage Area Standards (Table) of the St. John's Development Regulations, roof decks are not permitted in Heritage Area 1 unless they are an original feature of the structure. The roof deck proposed is not original to the structure and will be located on an extension at the rear of the dwelling. The rear of the property is adjacent to a neighbouring parking lot, does not face a public street and is not clearly visible from Henry Street. For design elements that do not meet the Heritage Area Standards, Council may approve the design through a comprehensive design package submitted by the applicant.

In addition to the application at hand, staff requested the Built Heritage Expert Panel's recommendation on roof decks in Heritage Area 1 in general, i.e. if changes to this regulation may or may not be required.

Discussion took place with agreement as follows:

- there is a need for a definition for roof deck
- an exception is warranted in considering this application as the proposed deck is not on the top roof and will not impede the views of neighboring properties.

It was agreed that the following recommendation be forwarded to Council for consideration.

Recommendation

Moved By Bruce Blackwood

Seconded By Mark Whalen

That Council approve the application to construct a roof deck at 5 Church Hill as proposed.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

4.2 Public Engagement - Sidewalk Snowclearing.

Rachel Fitkowski reported that she had attended a virtual public engagement session yesterday where members of various Council Committees were asked for input on sidewalk snowclearing. All attendees were asked to have their respective group consider stakeholders who may have input into this topic. Stakeholders identified at the session included:

- Public
- City Staff
- Seniors Advisory Committee
- Inclusion Advisory Committee
- Seniors NL
- City panels
- Facebook groups
- Active transit group

- Social Justice Co-op
- Association of New Canadians
- School Board

Members of the Panel were asked to provide Rachel with a list of other interested stakeholders who might wish to have input. She indicated that overall it was a good session and positive strategy.

5. ADOPTION OF THE MINUTES

5.1 Adoption of Minutes - March 11, 2020

Recommendation

Moved By Garnet Kindervater

Seconded By Bruce Blackwood

That the minutes be adopted as circulated

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

6. BUSINESS ARISING FROM THE MINUTES

6.1 68 Queen's Road, Heritage Designation

The Panel discussed and agreed that recognizing the proposed changes to the LUAR, the matter of designation of the Parish Hall be deferred at this time. It was noted however, that there is implied acceptance of a designation review, given the suggestions made and discussed in 3.2 above.

Recommendation

Moved By Garnet Kindervater

Seconded By Rachel Fitkowski

That the Built Heritage Experts Panel defer the designation of Cathedral Parish Hall, located at 68 Queens Road.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

6.2 Belvedere Convent - 57 Margaret's Place

Verbal Discussion

The Chief Municipal Planner informed the Panel of the continued efforts of staff to ensure the building is not demolished. Updates will be provided as they become available.

7. **ADJOURNMENT**

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 2:03 pm.

GLENN BARNES, CHAIR