



Minutes of Built Heritage Experts Panel

February 12, 2020

12:00 p.m.

Conference Room A, 4th Floor City Hall

Present: Glenn Barnes, Chairperson
Bruce Blackwood, Contractor
Garnet Kindervater, Contractor
Dawn Boutilier, Planner
Mark Whalen, Architecture
Ken O'Brien, Chief Municipal Planner
Ann Marie Cashin, Heritage and Urban Planner
Rob Schamper, Technical Advisor

Regrets: Rachel Fitkowski, Landscape Architect

Staff: Maureen Harvey, Legislative Assistant

2. APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA

Belvedere Convent - 57 Margaret's Place

Recommendation

Moved By Bruce Blackwood

Seconded By Garnet Kindervater

That the agenda be adopted with the addition of a verbal report on Belvedere Convent at 57 Margaret's Place.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

3. ADOPTION OF THE MINUTES

3.1 Adoption of Minutes - January 15, 2020

Recommendation

Moved By Bruce Blackwood

Seconded By Garnet Kindervater

That the minutes of the meeting held January 15, 2020 be adopted as presented.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

4. BUSINESS ARISING FROM THE MINUTES

4.1 Heritage Week 2020

The Panel was reminded that the City is celebrating Heritage Day on February 17 and Heritage Week from February 17-23. This year's theme is "2020 Vision: Bringing the Past into the Future". The following events are planned:

- Heritage Week Kick Off - Wyatt Hall - Friday, Feb. 14 at 10 a.m.

Heritage week will begin with the Prince of Wales flag raising followed by a coffee break to officially launch the celebrations. This event is an opportunity for the public to meet with City staff and members of Council at City Hall and to view the photo exhibit featuring local designated heritage buildings.

- Photo Exhibit: Designated Heritage Buildings - Wyatt Hall - February 14 to 21 from 8 a.m. to 4:30 p.m. weekdays

Images of local designated heritage buildings will be featured in this week-long photo exhibit.

- Heritage Awards Presentation and Proclamation - City Council Chambers - Monday, Feb. 17 at 4:30 p.m.

Join City Council and staff as they proclaim Heritage Day and present the 2020 Heritage Awards. These awards recognize commercial and residential property owners for their work in rehabilitating, restoring and celebrating our rich built heritage.

- Introductory Workshop: Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places - Foran/Greene Room - Wednesday, Feb. 19 from 9 a.m. to 4:00 p.m. This introductory workshop will help broaden participants' knowledge about standards and guidelines and how they can be effectively applied in planning, preservation, and adaptive

reuse for heritage structures, landscapes and districts. This interactive and participatory workshop will be delivered by David Scarlett, OAQ, MRAIC, Chief Architect (Built Heritage), Parks Canada Agency.

5. PRESENTATIONS/DELEGATIONS

5.1 164 Signal Hill Road - Single Detached Dwelling - DEV 1900165

The Panel reviewed the Decision Note which reports that this application for development was tabled with Council resulting in a request that it be reviewed by the Panel in relation to massing and height. While design is not under consideration at this time, the Panel felt it warranted some comments prior to the applicant moving too far along resulting in excess expenditure.

The subject property is located in Heritage Area 3, the Residential Low Density District of the St. John's Municipal Plan, and is zoned Comprehensive Development Area – Signal Hill/Battery (CDA – Signal Hill/Battery). The property previously housed a one-storey single detached dwelling which has been demolished. The applicant is proposing a two-storey dwelling with a maximum height of 7.85 metres. The property is located in the Battery Development Area and therefore Section 7.28 of the Development Regulations applies. In addition to the zone standards, the development of any property included in the Battery Development Area is also subject to the requirements of the Footprint and Height Control Overlay for the Battery Development Area, unless otherwise approved by Council. For this property, the Footprint and Height Control Overlay suggests a one-storey addition for vertical expansion and a horizontal expansion to the left when viewed from the road. The proposed development is in line with this suggestion, however in order to consider a maximum height of 7.85 metres, a Land Use Assessment Report and consultation with neighbouring properties was required before being referred to Council for approval.

The Panel welcomed Rick Pardy (applicant) and Paul Chafe (architect) to the meeting.

The applicant presented the application noting that while he is open to changes in design, the priority is to ensure there is approval for a two-storey dwelling with the size as proposed.

Discussion took place with the following points noted:

- While the proposed flat roof is intended to mitigate issues on the views of neighboring properties, the Panel suggested that consideration be given to a gable or hipped roof (with a mild slope) which would blend better with the character of the Battery.
- Another method of mitigating unfavorable views would be to build the home deeper into the bedrock.

In summary, the delegation committed to adjustments to design as long as the City is acceptable to the proposed mass and height. They also agreed to consider the Panel's suggestions on design and come back to a future meeting prior to finalizing same.

Recommendation

Moved By Bruce Blackwood

Seconded By Mark Whalen

That Council, grant development approval at 164 Signal Hill Road with the footprint as proposed. While two storeys are recommended, the Panel recommends the building be set lower than that which is shown in the renderings submitted.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

Recommendation

Moved By Mark Whalen

Seconded By Bruce Blackwood

That Council approve the following suggestions of the Built Heritage Experts Panel as it relates to design for the proposed dwelling at 164 Signal Hill Road.

- a. the applicant be required to ensure design, rock and color of the dwelling blends in with the historic character of the Battery.
- b. the applicant present a design that incorporates a consider a gabled or hipped roof to mitigate a negative impact of views for neighbors.
- c. the applicant reconsider a design that is more in keeping with the character of the Battery with integration of color, cladding and windows.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

6. NEW BUSINESS

6.1 Belvedere Convent - 57 Margarets Place

The vacant Belvedere Orphanage was the subject of a fire in 2017 which destroyed the building.

The nearby Belvedere Convent survived the fire but has been stripped out to the studs inside and has structural problems, including rot in its timbers and a failing stone foundation.

Mr. O'Brien informed the Panel that a developer has come forward with a suggestion of demolition or possible re-development of this property. Discussion took place with agreement that the Panel will meet on site February 25, 2020 at 2:00 pm.

GLENN BARNES, CHAIR