

ST. JOHN'S

Report of Built Heritage Experts Panel

February 5, 2025

12:00 p.m.

Virtual

Present: John Hancock, Architecture
Tyler Stapleton, Other
William Simms
Megan Webb, Historian/Archival Expert

Regrets: Michelle Sullivan, Other Category
Brian Marler, Contractor

Staff: Ken O'Brien, Chief Municipal Planner
Lindsay Church, Planner III - Urban Design and Heritage
Kent Decker, Technical Advisor
Jennifer Squires, Legislative Assistant

1. 39 Topsail Road – DEV2400064 – Heritage Report

Staff provided the Built Heritage Experts Panel (BHEP) with the December 18, 2024, Heritage Report for 39 Topsail Road. The application had been considered by the BHEP previously and the recommendations of the BHEP have been incorporated into the proposed design of the extension. Previous recommendations of the BHEP included the realignment of the extension with the existing Heritage Building, ensuring the extension was subservient to the Designated Heritage Building, fine tuning the design of the windows, and reconsideration of the modern central window design. Staff are now asking the BHEP to review the Heritage Report, determine if it satisfies the Heritage By-Law and meets the Heritage Design Standards, and make a recommendation to Council.

Overall, the BHEP were supportive of the changes made since their previous review of the design. The extension had been recessed further onto the property, with the building extension aligning more closely to the existing Designated Heritage Building. Additional changes were made to the windows, and the modern, central window feature has been removed.

Concern was raised on the lack of detail for the window mullions in the report. A definitive design would be preferred when considering designs for approval. Staff advised that details of the design at the building stage would be compared to the Heritage Report and that adherence to the standards would be confirmed. As Heritage Reports are a recent requirement, the Panel further noted that a precedent or standard for detail for Heritage Reports would be of benefit.

The Heritage Report indicated that the finish and colour of the extension would be similar to that used on the Designated Heritage Building. In the construction details, the siding is noted as being "Cape cod siding." The Panel recommended that the siding on the extension adhere to the design, colour, and materials as proposed in the Report.

The proposed trim of the extension was then discussed. A PVC product is being proposed, which is permitted for the extension as per the Heritage Design Standards. While the BHEP would prefer a wood trim to an alternative product, they did understand the reasoning for selecting such materials where permitted in the Standards. As wood becomes more scarce and expensive, the use of PVC in Heritage Areas will become a concern and will require additional consideration.

Recommendation

Moved By John Hancock

Seconded By Megan Webb

The Built Heritage Experts Panel recommends that Council approve the Heritage Report for 39 Topsail Road dated December 18, 2024, subject to the following conditions:

- The clapboard colour and quality remain consistent with the existing Heritage Building and in the Cape Cod style as indicated in the Heritage Report.
- That the size and style of windows and mullions are consistent with what has been proposed on page 20 of the Heritage Report.

The BHEP would further recommend that wood trim be used if possible but will accept the use of the alternative material as proposed in the Heritage Report.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY