

ST. JOHN'S

Minutes of Built Heritage Experts Panel

September 17, 2019

12:00 p.m.

Conference Room A, 4th Floor City Hall

Present: Glenn Barnes, Chairperson
Bruce Blackwood, Contractor
Garnet Kindervater, Contractor
Rachel Fitkowski, Landscape Architect
Mark Whalen, Architecture
Ken O'Brien, Chief Municipal Planner
Ann Marie Cashin, Heritage and Urban Planner
Rob Schamper, Technical Advisor

Regrets: Dawn Boutilier, Planner

Staff: Maureen Harvey, Legislative Assistant

1. CALL TO ORDER

The meeting was called to order by the Chair at 12 noon.

2. PRESENTATIONS/DELEGATIONS

2.1 22 St. Joseph's Lane - Exterior Renovations

Delegation - Mr. Wayne Purchase - Martek, Morgan, Finch

While there has not been a formal application submitted for the exterior renovations to 22 St. Joseph's Lane, the Panel welcomed Mr. Wayne Purchase to discuss the technical aspects of the proposed work. Mr. Purchase informed the group that the building is the subject of multiple water filtration issues of caused mainly through leaking windows resulting in the inability to rent the space.

Discussion took place with the Panel expressing appreciation for the pro action of the developer in reaching out to the Panel before costly decisions are made.

Mr. Churchill thanked the panel for the suggestion of low profile Nichiha siding which has been favorable on a number of buildings. He retired from the meeting at 12:30 pm.

2.2 Information Note dated September 11, 2019 re: 68 Queen's Road (Cathedral Parish Hall), Designated Heritage Building Rezoning Application for a 40-unit Residential Development - MPA1900002-Land Use Assessment Report

The Panel reviewed the Information note which provided the background and current status of the application to develop 40 residential units in two buildings at 68 Queen's Road. A Land Use Assessment Report was a requirement prior to consideration of a rezoning to the Commercial Central Mixed Use (CCM) Zone.

Ms. Cashin informed the panel that this application has already been considered twice by the Panel - once before design and again following adjustments based on those discussions. She noted that staff is currently reviewing the LUAR and initial comments have been provided to the applicant. Once staff is satisfied with the comments the matter will be presented at a Public Meeting.

The Panel was informed there are two issues for consideration:

- a. whether it recommends amending the designation to allow the development to proceed
- b. whether the Panel is in agreement with the proposed design i.e. to demolition of the mid-section of the building retaining the house and the archway. It was noted the applicant is seeking approval for partial demolition

The Panel welcomed Philip Pratt and Paul Chafe (at 12:50 pm) who were in attendance to respond to any questions the Panel may have with respect to the proposed development.

Mr. Pratt stated that the proposal put forward is well within what the CCM Zone permits.

Discussion took place on the plan to demolish the mid-section of the building with the Panel expressing concern that there may be no

safeguards to protect the remainder of the structure. It was also noted that any new structure should echo the look of previous structure. Mr. Pratt indicated the developer's intent to protect the adjoining structures using measures such as hand demolition and underpinning. He stated all materials will be stacked, placed on pallets and sealed to protect the integrity of material for future use in the building. He also stated they will be seeking expertise in this area.

While the Panel was receptive in the effort to preserve the structure, it cautioned the delegation that about the potential for preservation to fail and the City losing a significant piece of heritage.

Discussion continued with the main emphasis on the proposed demolition and the impact this will have if not done successfully. It was noted that demolition will only be considered once approval of the project is given. The application for a demolition permit will be carefully scrutinized with specific requirements set out by staff of the PERS Department.

The delegation retired from the meeting at which time discussion concluded with agreement of the following:

- a. the proposal as presented shows too much massing and curtain wall
- b. protection of heritage must be the first priority
- c. more detail is required in the LUAR on deconstruction and reconstruction
- d. the developer should consider the feasibility of undertaking the Queen's Road portion of the project last. The developer should look at alternative ways to access the site.
- e. the application should come back to the Panel for further consideration once at the development stage if the amendment is approved.

2.3 Information Note dated September 11, 2019 re: 1 Clift's-Baird's Cove - Proposed Hotel Above Atlantic Place Parking Garage - Land Use Assessment Report

Ken O'Brien retired from the meeting at 1:30 pm.

The City has received a Land Use Assessment Report (LUAR) from John Hearn Architect Inc. and PARTISANS, on behalf of Sonco Group Inc. for the development of a 4-storey hotel above the Atlantic Place Parking Garage. The proposed development will also include a small retail area at the ground floor and renovations to the parking garage. The LUAR was a

requirement of Council prior to consideration of a text amendment to the A. P. Parking Garage Zone to increase the maximum height from 11-storeys to 12-storeys.

The subject property is located in the A.P. Parking Garage District and Zone. The property is not located within the Heritage Area, however given its proximity to Heritage Area 1 and a number of designated Heritage Buildings, Council has referred the application to the Built Heritage Experts Panel (BHEP) to evaluate the design. Where the property is not in a Heritage Area, *Regulation 5.9.4 Heritage Area Standards (Table)* of the St. John's Development Regulations does not apply.

The existing parking garage is 8-storeys. The applicants are proposing to add an additional 4-storey hotel above the parking garage for a total of 12-storeys. Under the current zoning, the maximum height is 11-storeys, and a hotel located on the 9th and/or higher storeys is a discretionary use. A Municipal Plan and Development Regulations amendment is required to consider a 12-storey development.

The applicants have proposed a design to make the hotel portion distinguishable from the parking garage. In the LUAR, it is described as a composition of volumes, where the parking garage, hotel rooms, lobby and sauna area each are contained in distinguishable volume. The renovation will include wrapping that existing garage with a perforated, powder-coated white metal screen. Along the Harbour Drive side of the parking garage, the LUAR states that the applicants are proposing to include a silhouette graphic of a supply vessel as a way to connect the Parkhotel to the harbor, but this may change in further revisions. The hotel portion is proposed to be powder-coated metal panels in various colours, with black spandrel (opaque) glass for the hotel rooms.

At this stage, staff are reviewing the LUAR and have provided initial comments to the applicants. Once staff are satisfied with the LUAR, the application will be referred to a Public Meeting chaired by an independent facilitator. Any recommendations from the Panel will be forwarded to the applicants with the staff comments and will be included in the information

forwarded to Council following the public meeting. As the LUAR is currently in draft form, it will be sent to the Panel under a separate cover

The Panel welcomed John Hearn to the meeting and entertained the display of the proposed design.

Mr. Hearn informed the Panel that the structure is being designed as an international destination hotel, not with typical downtown style. He compared it to the look of the Fogo Island Inn. He stated the intent was to pick up on St. John's colors and break the proposal down into smaller components.

Discussion took place with the following comments noteworthy:

- Consideration ought to be given to engaging the arts community for an appropriate and appeal mural to be installed on the south side of the building.
- The color scheme chosen was intentionally bold to draw attention to the building
- The proposed retail section of the building (at the southern side, ground floor) will be a valued asset that will enhance the downtown.
- Mr. Hearn stated this is an iconic design that will enhance other buildings in the downtown.

Mr. Hearn retired from the meeting at 2:07 pm.

Discussion concluded noting that while the site of the proposed development is outside a heritage area, the surrounding area of this proposed development is prime heritage area. The Panel agreed that the design does exactly what the developer intended i.e. to make the building stand out. It was suggested that the use of yellow should be muted in order to not detract from the heritage buildings on Water Street. It was also agreed that any mural/sculpture design on the south side should be meaningful and not appear as a billboard for advertisements etc. and should not include illumination. Any proposed art installation should be determined prior to development approval as the applicant suggested that it could influence the use of colour in the final design. It was noted that the restriction on height of the structure will be favorable in retaining the view of the harbour from other buildings in the downtown. The Panel is appreciative of the pedestrian improvements on the ground level.

The Panel was informed that its comments will be included in the information brought forward to a public meeting which will be scheduled once Council considers the application.

4. ADOPTION OF THE MINUTES

4.1 Adoption of Minutes - August 14, 2019

Recommendation

Moved By Bruce Blackwood

Seconded By Rachel Fitkowski

That the minutes of the meeting held on August 14, 2019 be accepted with the following amendment.

Item 5.1 Page 2 - 2nd bullet from the bottom - It was noted that stock doors can be purchased and modified.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

5. BUSINESS ARISING FROM THE MINUTES

6. NEW BUSINESS

6.1 193 Water Street - Designated Heritage Building Exterior

For discussion only.

The Panel was shown a picture of the building at 193 Water Street where a modern tile was used to modify the front facade. It was noted this work was completed without a permit. In the interest of time, Ms. Cashin informed the Panel it may be forwarded a request for consideration by and e-vote.

7. ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 2:25 pm

GLENN BARNES, CHAIR