

DECISION/DIRECTION NOTE

Title: 265 LeMarchant Road, Heritage Report TOR, DEV2200040

Date Prepared: May 11, 2022

Report To: Committee of the Whole

Councillor and Role: Councillor Maggie Burton, Heritage

Ward: Ward 2

Decision/Direction Required:

To approve the draft Heritage Report terms of reference for a proposed extension and renovation at 265 LeMarchant Road (former West Fire Station), a designated Heritage Building.

Discussion – Background and Current Status:

The City has received an application to convert the former West Fire Station or West End Fire Hall, located at 265 LeMarchant Road, to an Apartment Building. The applicant is proposing to add two floors, to increase the number of storeys from 2 to 4, and horizontal expansion at the rear of the building. The structure will house 16 residential units. The applicant is in the initial design stage and the proposed expansion is subject to change. The application arises from a Request for Proposals issued by the City for the sale and re-development of the site.

The subject property is within the Institutional District of the St. John's Municipal Plan, and zoned Institutional Downtown (INST-DT). The property is within Heritage Area 3 and was designated by Council as a Heritage Building in December 2021. The statement of significance, historic photos and INST-DT Zone table are attached for reference. Please note, the applicant would be permitted to develop within the parameters of the zone requirements, including increasing the height of the building to the maximum height permitted within the zone (23 metres), however the design would still need approval Council for a Heritage Building.

The applicant presented the attached rendering to the Built Heritage Experts Panel during the May 27, 2022 meeting. The Panel observed that that the proposed design did not meet the St. John's Heritage By-Law heritage design standards for designated heritage buildings. For building extensions, the design standards require the following:

Additions shall be the same architectural style, or similar and compatible with the building's architectural characteristics.

Modern façade designs may be approved by Council provided the addition is physically and visually compatible with, subordinate to and distinguishable from the designated building; enhances the visual prominence of the designated building; and does not detract from the character-defining elements of the designated building.

ST. JOHN'S

The Panel commented that the proposed design was not subordinate to and distinguishable from the designated building, and recommended revisions to the proposal to meet the design standards. For example, they suggested to step back the upper storeys from the front façade of the original building to better highlight the original part.

From Section 8 of the Heritage By-Law, Council shall require a Heritage Report for any application where recommended by the Inspector. A Heritage Report will evaluate and identify heritage values and resources located on the site, neighbourhood or streetscape, and address the anticipated impacts that the proposed work may have. A major expansion to a Heritage Building is a case where a Heritage Report is needed. The attached terms of reference will help the applicant, the City and the Panel determine the best way to expand the building while respecting the Heritage Building.

Draft terms of reference for a Heritage Report are attached for Council's review. The Built Heritage Experts Panel agrees with requiring a Heritage Report and their comments have been incorporated into the draft terms. Public consultation is not required for Heritage Reports, however Council may ask for public consultation for any matter. In this case, staff feel that the Heritage Report and consultation with the Panel will be sufficient. Should Council decide on public consultation, it may be more beneficial to require it before the applicants prepare their Heritage Report.

Key Considerations/Implications:

1. Budget/Financial Implications: Not applicable.
2. Partners or Other Stakeholders: City of St. John's; neighbouring residents and property owners; heritage groups.

3. Alignment with Strategic Directions:

A Sustainable City: Plan for land use and preserve and enhance the natural and built environment where we live.

A Sustainable City: Facilitate and create the conditions that drive the economy by being business and industry friendly; and being a location of choice for residents, businesses and visitors.

4. Alignment with Adopted Plans: St. John's Heritage By-Law; Envision St. John's Development Regulations.
5. Legal or Policy Implications: Not applicable.
6. Privacy Implications: No applicable.
7. Engagement and Communications Considerations: Under the Heritage By-Law, Council may require public consultation for any matter where Council so directs.

8. Human Resource Implications: Not applicable.
9. Procurement Implications: Not applicable.
10. Information Technology Implications: Not applicable.
11. Other Implications: Not applicable.

Recommendation:

That Council approve the attached draft Heritage Report terms of reference to consider an expansion to the designated Heritage Building (the former West Fire Station) at 265 LeMarchant Road.

Prepared by: Ann-Marie Cashin, MCIP, Planner III – Urban Design & Heritage
Approved by: Ken O'Brien, MCIP, Chief Municipal Planner

Report Approval Details

Document Title:	265 LeMarchant Road, Heritage Report TOR, DEV2200040 (COTW).docx
Attachments:	- 265 LeMarchant Road - Heritage Report TOR and Attachments.pdf
Final Approval Date:	May 12, 2022

This report and all of its attachments were approved and signed as outlined below:

Ken O'Brien - May 12, 2022 - 11:48 AM

No Signature - Task assigned to Jason Sinyard was completed by workflow administrator Karen Chafe

Jason Sinyard - May 12, 2022 - 11:50 AM