



## Built Experts Heritage Panel Agenda

March 11, 2020

12:00 p.m.

Conference Room A, 4th Floor City Hall

Pages

1. CALL TO ORDER
2. PRESENTATIONS/DELEGATIONS
3. APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA
4. ADOPTION OF THE MINUTES
  - 4.1 Adoption of Minutes - February 12, 2020 1
5. BUSINESS ARISING FROM THE MINUTES
  - 5.1 2020 Heritage Financial Incentives Program 6
  - 5.2 Belvedere Convent - 57 Margarets Place  
Verbal update.
6. NEW BUSINESS
  - 6.1 Expiration of Members  
Verbal Discussion
7. ADJOURNMENT

# ST. JOHN'S

## Minutes of Built Heritage Experts Panel

February 12, 2020

12:00 p.m.

Conference Room A, 4th Floor City Hall

Present: Glenn Barnes, Chairperson  
Bruce Blackwood, Contractor  
Garnet Kindervater, Contractor  
Dawn Boutilier, Planner  
Mark Whalen, Architecture  
Ken O'Brien, Chief Municipal Planner  
Ann Marie Cashin, Heritage and Urban Planner  
Rob Schamper, Technical Advisor

Regrets: Rachel Fitkowski, Landscape Architect

Staff: Maureen Harvey, Legislative Assistant

### 2. APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA

Belvedere Convent - 57 Margaret's Place

#### **Recommendation**

**Moved By** Bruce Blackwood

**Seconded By** Garnet Kindervater

That the agenda be adopted with the addition of a verbal report on Belvedere Convent at 57 Margaret's Place.

**CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**

### 3. ADOPTION OF THE MINUTES

#### 3.1 Adoption of Minutes - January 15, 2020

**Recommendation**

**Moved By** Bruce Blackwood

**Seconded By** Garnet Kindervater

That the minutes of the meeting held January 15, 2020 be adopted as presented.

**CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**

**4. BUSINESS ARISING FROM THE MINUTES**

**4.1 Heritage Week 2020**

The Panel was reminded that the City is celebrating Heritage Day on February 17 and Heritage Week from February 17-23. This year's theme is "2020 Vision: Bringing the Past into the Future". The following events are planned:

- Heritage Week Kick Off - Wyatt Hall - Friday, Feb. 14 at 10 a.m.

Heritage week will begin with the Prince of Wales flag raising followed by a coffee break to officially launch the celebrations. This event is an opportunity for the public to meet with City staff and members of Council at City Hall and to view the photo exhibit featuring local designated heritage buildings.

- Photo Exhibit: Designated Heritage Buildings - Wyatt Hall - February 14 to 21 from 8 a.m. to 4:30 p.m. weekdays

Images of local designated heritage buildings will be featured in this week-long photo exhibit.

- Heritage Awards Presentation and Proclamation - City Council Chambers - Monday, Feb. 17 at 4:30 p.m.

Join City Council and staff as they proclaim Heritage Day and present the 2020 Heritage Awards. These awards recognize commercial and residential property owners for their work in rehabilitating, restoring and celebrating our rich built heritage.

- Introductory Workshop: Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places - Foran/Greene Room - Wednesday, Feb. 19 from 9 a.m. to 4:00 p.m. This introductory workshop will help broaden participants' knowledge about standards and guidelines and how they can be effectively applied in planning, preservation, and adaptive

reuse for heritage structures, landscapes and districts. This interactive and participatory workshop will be delivered by David Scarlett, OAQ, MRAIC, Chief Architect (Built Heritage), Parks Canada Agency.

## **5. PRESENTATIONS/DELEGATIONS**

### **5.1 164 Signal Hill Road - Single Detached Dwelling - DEV 1900165**

The Panel reviewed the Decision Note which reports that this application for development was tabled with Council resulting in a request that it be reviewed by the Panel in relation to massing and height. While design is not under consideration at this time, the Panel felt it warranted some comments prior to the applicant moving too far along resulting in excess expenditure.

The subject property is located in Heritage Area 3, the Residential Low Density District of the St. John's Municipal Plan, and is zoned Comprehensive Development Area – Signal Hill/Battery (CDA – Signal Hill/Battery). The property previously housed a one-storey single detached dwelling which has been demolished. The applicant is proposing a two-storey dwelling with a maximum height of 7.85 metres. The property is located in the Battery Development Area and therefore Section 7.28 of the Development Regulations applies. In addition to the zone standards, the development of any property included in the Battery Development Area is also subject to the requirements of the Footprint and Height Control Overlay for the Battery Development Area, unless otherwise approved by Council. For this property, the Footprint and Height Control Overlay suggests a one-storey addition for vertical expansion and a horizontal expansion to the left when viewed from the road. The proposed development is in line with this suggestion, however in order to consider a maximum height of 7.85 metres, a Land Use Assessment Report and consultation with neighbouring properties was required before being referred to Council for approval.

The Panel welcomed Rick Pardy (applicant) and Paul Chafe (architect) to the meeting.

The applicant presented the application noting that while he is open to changes in design, the priority is to ensure there is approval for a two-storey dwelling with the size as proposed.

Discussion took place with the following points noted:

- While the proposed flat roof is intended to mitigate issues on the views of neighboring properties, the Panel suggested that consideration be given to a gable or hipped roof (with a mild slope) which would blend better with the character of the Battery.
- Another method of mitigating unfavorable views would be to build the home deeper into the bedrock.

In summary, the delegation committed to adjustments to design as long as the City is acceptable to the proposed mass and height. They also agreed to consider the Panel's suggestions on design and come back to a future meeting prior to finalizing same.

**Recommendation**

**Moved By** Bruce Blackwood

**Seconded By** Mark Whalen

That Council, grant development approval at 164 Signal Hill Road with the footprint as proposed. While two storeys are recommended, the Panel recommends the building be set lower than that which is shown in the renderings submitted.

**CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**

**Recommendation**

**Moved By** Mark Whalen

**Seconded By** Bruce Blackwood

That Council approve the following suggestions of the Built Heritage Experts Panel as it relates to design for the proposed dwelling at 164 Signal Hill Road.

- a. the applicant be required to ensure design, rock and color of the dwelling blends in with the historic character of the Battery.
- b. the applicant present a design that incorporates a consider a gabled or hipped roof to mitigate a negative impact of views for neighbors.
- c. the applicant reconsider a design that is more in keeping with the character of the Battery with integration of color, cladding and windows.

**CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**

**6. NEW BUSINESS**

**6.1 Belvedere Convent - 57 Margarets Place**

The vacant Belvedere Orphanage was the subject of a fire in 2017 which destroyed the building.

The nearby Belvedere Convent survived the fire but has been stripped out to the studs inside and has structural problems, including rot in its timbers and a failing stone foundation.

Mr. O'Brien informed the Panel that a developer has come forward with a suggestion of demolition or possible re-development of this property. Discussion took place with agreement that the Panel will meet on site February 25, 2020 at 2:00 pm.

---

GLENN BARNES, CHAIR

# DECISION/DIRECTION NOTE

---

**Title:** 2020 Heritage Financial Incentives Program

**Date Prepared:** March 2, 2020

**Report To:** Chair and Members, Built Heritage Experts Panel

**Councillor and Role:** Councillor Maggie Burton, Planning and Development Lead

**Ward:** All

---

## **Decision/Direction Required:**

To seek approval to include historic wrought iron fences in the Heritage Financial Incentives Program.

## **Discussion – Background and Current Status:**

On March 1, 2020, the City began accepting applications for the 2020 Heritage Financial Incentives Program. Applications are accepted from March 1 to May 1 each year. This will be the fifth year that the Incentives Program has been offered.

The Heritage Financial Incentives Program is intended to defray some of the cost associated with maintaining and conserving municipally designated Heritage Buildings and those buildings located in the City's designated Heritage Areas. While the Heritage Areas are primarily in Ward 2, there are Designated Heritage Buildings throughout the City.

There are two types of Financial Incentives offered: the Heritage Maintenance Grant and the Heritage Conservation Grant. Attached is a description of the program and a list of eligible work projects pertaining to each grant.

Under the current program, fences, outbuildings and landscaping are not eligible for assistance. Some citizens have asked the City to allow financial assistance for historic wrought iron fences given the associated cost to replace such fences, and that there are few wrought iron fences remaining. If wrought iron fences are to be included in the Heritage Financial Incentives Program, the grants could be limited to properties with existing historic wrought iron fences and only include fences along a public street. New installations of wrought iron fences where they did not previously exist would not be included.

Wrought iron fences would be best included in the Heritage Maintenance Grant only, which could issue a grant of 25% of the material and labour costs to a maximum of \$1,000 per building, per calendar year.

**Key Considerations/Implications:**

1. Budget/Financial Implications:  
Addition to be included in the Heritage Financial Grant Program.
2. Partners or Other Stakeholders:  
Property owners of Designated Heritage Buildings and buildings in the Heritage Areas.
3. Alignment with Strategic Directions/Adopted Plans:  
*A Sustainable City*: Plan for land use and preserve and enhance the natural and built environment where we live.
4. Legal or Policy Implications: Not applicable.
5. Privacy Implications: Not applicable.
6. Engagement and Communications Considerations:  
Will be promoted through engagement and communications of the program.
7. Human Resource Implications: Not applicable.
8. Procurement Implications: Not applicable.
9. Information Technology Implications: Not applicable.
10. Other Implications: Not applicable.

**Recommendation:**

That the Built Heritage Experts Panel review the documentation provided on including wrought iron fences in the Heritage Financial Incentives Program, and make a recommendation to Council on this matter.



**Report Approval Details**

Document Title:	2020 Heritage Financial Incentives Program.docx
Attachments:	- Heritage Financial Incentives Program _ City Of St. John's.pdf
Final Approval Date:	Mar 5, 2020

This report and all of its attachments were approved and signed as outlined below:

**Ken O'Brien - Mar 3, 2020 - 3:01 PM**

**Jason Sinyard - Mar 5, 2020 - 11:51 AM**

## Heritage Financial Incentives Program

This Program is enacted pursuant to Section 355 of the [City of St. John's Act](#)  
Revised January 2017



### 1. Program:

The Heritage Financial Incentives Program is intended to defray some of the development costs associated with maintaining and conserving municipally designated Heritage Buildings and those buildings located in the City's designated [Heritage Areas](#), also referred to as "Heritage Properties". The applicant must demonstrate the cost difference and the grant will not exceed the amount of the cost difference.

### 2. Financial Incentives:

**2.1 Heritage Maintenance Grant:** This grant is for the maintenance and repair to façade elements abutting a public street. A grant of up to 25 per cent of the material and labour costs will be available to a maximum of \$1,000 per building, per calendar year.

**2.2 Heritage Conservation Grant:** This grant is for the preservation, restoration and/or replacement of façade elements abutting a public street. A grant of up to 25 per cent of the material and labour costs will be available to a maximum of \$5,000 per building, per calendar year.

**2.3 Permit Waiver:** Once a grant application is approved, Council may waive associated permit fees.

### 3. General Conditions:

**3.1** All work funded by a grant shall comply with all applicable Federal, Provincial and Municipal legislation.

**3.2** Any work undertaken prior to grant approval shall be identified and may be considered for funding at Council's discretion provided the City receives the grant application within the time frame as specified in Section 7.1 and within two (2) years of the date the Building Permit was issued.

**3.3** For clarity, the use of vinyl siding is permissible in Heritage areas 2 & 3, however, vinyl siding shall not be eligible for funding.

### 4. Eligible Work Projects for the Heritage Maintenance Grant:

**4.1** Measures undertaken for the maintenance and repair to façade elements abutting a public street, including but not limited to:

- Work to conserve the exterior such as: cornices, parapets, dormers, towers, windows, doors, canopies, and decorative features such as panels, mouldings, trims, carvings and similar architectural details. Subject to demonstrated need, cladding stabilization may also be eligible. This includes the repair and restoration of terracotta and the repointing of stone and brick masonry.
- Work to reconstruct missing exterior elements. This work must be based on drawings, photographs, surviving physical remnants, or other acceptable evidence of the original design.
- Repainting or re-coating of the exterior elements.
- Replacement or repair of roofing shingles, rain gutters, downspouts, flashing, exterior caulking and chimneys to prevent further deterioration due to weather infiltration.

## 5. Eligible Work Projects for the Heritage Conservation Grant:

5.1 Measures undertaken for the preservation, restoration and/or replacement of façade elements abutting a public street, including but not limited to:

- **Preservation** of existing exterior architectural elements. This may include the preservation of deteriorated windows and doors, cladding, roofing, foundation, cornices, mouldings, architectural trim and other significant features.
- **Restoration** of exterior architectural elements which have been lost but for which the appearance can be clearly determined from physical evidence or documentary sources such as historic drawings or photographs.
- **Replacement** of existing exterior architectural elements that still exist but which are beyond preservation or repair. This includes replacement of deteriorated doors and windows, cladding, roofing, cornices, mouldings, architectural trim, and other significant features.

## 6. Not Eligible for Assistance:

6.1 The following works shall not be eligible:

- New construction;
- Demolition;
- The removal, storage and/or reuse of façade of demolished Heritage Buildings;
- Signage;
- Fences, outbuildings, and landscaping;
- Building relocation;
- Vinyl siding;
- Legal fees and borrowing costs; and
- Owner's labour.

## 7. Application for a Heritage Grant:

7.1 An [application](#) for a Heritage Grant shall be made in writing to the City between March 1<sup>st</sup> and May 1<sup>st</sup>.

7.2 An application shall be signed by the property owner or a person operating under the owner's written consent. A copy of the written consent shall accompany the application.

7.3 Applications shall include:

- a completed application form;
- current, coloured photographs of the façade abutting a public street, with close-ups of the areas of work, for which the grant is applied. Photographs may be submitted digitally by e-mail or USB drive;
- two cost estimate quotes for the proposed work; and,
- supporting documentation substantiating the amount of increased costs attributed to the designation as a municipal Heritage Building or due to its location in one of the City's Heritage Areas.

7.4 Late or incomplete applications will not be considered.

## **8. Priority of Grant Applications:**

8.1 Priority will be given to:

- designated municipal Heritage Buildings;
- first-time applications;
- the preservation, restoration and weatherproofing historic elements rather than cosmetic improvements; and
- applications supported by a Conservation Plan or a Heritage Report prepared by a design professional (architect, engineer or qualified restoration professional).

## **9. Review Process:**

9.1 Applications will be evaluated based on eligibility of work and the work's positive impact to the public streetscape.

9.2 The Heritage Planner, or his or her designate, shall review and make recommendations to the Built Heritage Experts Panel.

9.3 The Built Heritage Experts Panel shall make recommendations to Council.

9.4 Council may, in its sole discretion approve, approve with conditions, or refuse a grant application.

9.5 Applicants shall be notified in writing of Council's decision.

## **10. Applicant's Responsibilities on Approval of a Grant**

10.1 Upon approval of a grant application the applicant shall:

- submit all costs and work plans to the City;

- obtain a building permit, if one is required, from the City;
- notify the City when there is any deviations to the costs and/or work plans;
- provide any other information as may be requested by Council; and,
- complete the project as set out in the grant application.

## **11. Funding:**

11.1 Funding for the Heritage Financial Incentive Program may be established by Council on an annual bases during budget deliberations.

11.2 Each property shall be limited to one (1) grant per calendar year, and two (2) grants in any four (4) consecutive calendar years.

## **12. Conditions for Grant Payment**

12.1 Applicants are required to complete all work and submit proof of payment of all paid invoices pertaining to the work within 24 months from the date of Council's approval of the grant.

12.2 Applicants shall submit coloured photographs of the completed work for which the grant is applied. Photographs may be submitted digitally by e-mail or USB drive.

12.3 All work and documentation must be deemed satisfactory upon inspection by the City prior to the disbursement of the grant. If upon final inspection it has been determined that the work has not been completed as per approved plans; and/or, has not been completed in compliance with all applicable legislation, the grant will be cancelled.

12.4 The grant may be cancelled should the work associated with it remain incomplete 24 months after approval of the grant.

12.5 In addition, once a grant is approved, the City may waive any associate permit fees on the application.