

# **AGENDA**

## **Built Heritage Experts Panel**

Tuesday, September 17, 2019

12:00 pm

Conference Room A

4<sup>th</sup> Floor, City Hall

ST. JOHN'S

---

# ST. JOHN'S

## Built Experts Heritage Panel Agenda

September 17, 2019

12:00 p.m.

Conference Room A, 4th Floor City Hall

Pages

**1. CALL TO ORDER**

**2. PRESENTATIONS/DELEGATIONS**

**2.1 22 St. Joseph's Lane - Exterior Renovations**

Delegation at 12:15 pm. For discussion only. No attachments. Mr. Wayne Purchase will be in attendance.

**2.2 Information Note dated September 11, 2019 re: 68 Queen's Road (Cathedral Parish Hall), Designated Heritage Building Rezoning Application for a 40-unit Residential Development - MPA1900002- Land Use Assessment Report**

1

Philip Pratt and/or Paul Chafe will be in attendance at 12:30 pm.

**2.3 Information Note dated September 11, 2019 re: 1 Clift's-Baird's Cove - Proposed Hotel Above Atlantic Place Parking Garage- Land Use Assessment Report**

4

Delegation at 1:00 pm - Mr. John Hearn

**3. APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA**

**4. ADOPTION OF THE MINUTES**

**4.1 Adoption of Minutes - August 14, 2019**

6

**5. BUSINESS ARISING FROM THE MINUTES**

**6. NEW BUSINESS**

**6.1 193 Water Street - Designated Heritage Building Exterior**

For discussion only.

## 7. ADJOURNMENT

# INFORMATION NOTE

---

**Title:** 68 Queen's Road (Cathedral Parish Hall),  
Designated Heritage Building  
Rezoning Application for a 40-unit Residential Development  
MPA1900002  
Land Use Assessment Report

**Date Prepared:** September 11, 2019

**Report To:** Chair and Members, Built Heritage Experts Panel

**Councillor & Role:** Councillor Maggie Burton, Planning and Development Lead

**Ward:** 2

---

## **Discussion – Background and Current Status:**

The City has received a Land Use Assessment Report (LUAR) from Philip Pratt Architecture on behalf of Parish Lane Development Inc. for the development of 40 residential units in two buildings at 68 Queen's Road. The LUAR was a requirement of Council prior to consideration of a rezoning to the Commercial Central Mixed Use (CCM) Zone.

The property is currently zoned Institutional (INST) at the front of the property along Queen's Road and Open Space (O) at the rear of the property along Harvey Road, which do not permit this type of residential development. A Municipal Plan amendment would also be required. The subject property is within Heritage Area 1 and Cathedral Parish Hall is designated by Council as a Heritage Building.

The Parish Hall was formerly an institutional use associated with the Anglican Cathedral of St. John the Baptist and if the building is no longer going to be associated with an institution, CCM would be an appropriate zone. Many of the surrounding properties are currently zoned CCM and this zone would allow for a mixture of commercial, office or residential uses should the proposal change.

## Design

The applicant is proposing to develop two new buildings on the site and to renovate the existing Residence Building. Renovations to the Residence Building will form Phase 1 of the development and will contain 2-units. Phase 2 will include development of a 25-unit building at the rear of the lot and Phase 3 will include a 13-unit building along Queen's Road.

The 5-storey building along Queen's Road (which would attach to the designated buildings), is proposed to have clay stack brick in a Shaw Red Range colour

# ST. JOHN'S

for majority of the building and areas of large clear glass windows. The applicants are proposing a metal standing seam asymmetrical front-gable roof, and natural and cultured stone for the ramp and retaining walls.

The 5-storey building facing Harvey Road is proposed to include majority calcium silican rain screen, with a grey bed stone trim around the main entrance. The rear of the building will include large areas of clear glass. Given the slope of the property, this building will be 5-stories at Harvey Road, but 9-stories at the rear.

#### Heritage Designation

Cathedral Parish Hall is designated as a Heritage Building by Council and the designation is confined to the footprint of the building. The main entrance is designed in the Classical Revival style with arched transom, pilasters, keystone decoration, dentials and quoining. From the Statement of Significance, the character defining elements of this building include the original main entrance, the house-like addition on the left gable end of the building, and the size, dimension and location of the building. This site is also located in Heritage Area 1 and the St. John's Ecclesiastical District.

If this proposal proceeds, the applicant is requesting to demolish a large portion of the building but will maintain the house at the left gable end of the building and will incorporate the original arch and adjacent original windows into the new development. The Parish Hall has been heavily altered and little original material remains, aside from the arch and two windows. The project is dependant on removals of the designation for the majority of Parish Hall. The applicant is proposing to maintain the portions of the building which are character-defining elements in the Statement of Significance.

To protect these elements, an option may be to remove the heritage designation from the bulk of the building, but leave the house and archway area as a designated Heritage Building. This option would protect the original, character-defining elements of the building, while allowing revitalization of the site. This is an item for discussion with the BHEP. Please note, the rezoning could proceed without removing the designation, however the development could not.

At this stage, staff are reviewing the LUAR and have provided initial comments to the applicants. Once staff are satisfied with the LUAR, the application will be referred to a Public Meeting chaired by an independent facilitator. Any recommendations from the Panel will be forwarded to the applicants with the staff comments and will be included in the information forwarded to Council following the public meeting. As the LUAR is currently in draft form, it will be sent to the Panel under a separate cover.

#### **Key Considerations/Implications:**

1. Budget/Financial Implications: Not Applicable.
2. Partners or Other Stakeholders: Not Applicable.

3. Alignment with Strategic Directions/Adopted Plans:  
*A Sustainable City:* Plan for land use and preserve and enhance the natural and built environment where we live.
4. Legal or Policy Implications:  
An amendment to the St. John's Municipal Plan and Development Regulations is required.
5. Engagement and Communications Considerations: Not Applicable.
6. Human Resource Implications: Not Applicable.
7. Procurement Implications: Not Applicable.
8. Information Technology Implications: Not Applicable.
9. Other Implications: Not Applicable.

**Conclusion/Next Steps:**

Any recommendations from the Panel will be forwarded to the applicants with the staff comments and will be included in the information forwarded to Council following the public meeting.

**Prepared by/Signature:**

Ann-Marie Cashin, MCIP – Planner III, Urban Design and Heritage

Signature: \_\_\_\_\_

**Approved by/Date/Signature:**

Ken O'Brien, MCIP – Chief Municipal Planner

Signature: \_\_\_\_\_

AMC/dlm

**Attachments**

Land Use Assessment Report (sent under a separate cover)

# INFORMATION NOTE

---

<b>Title:</b>	1 Clift's-Baird's Cove Proposed Hotel Above Atlantic Place Parking Garage Land Use Assessment Report
<b>Date Prepared:</b>	September 11, 2019
<b>Report To:</b>	Chair and Members, Built Heritage Experts Panel
<b>Councillor &amp; Role:</b>	Councillor Maggie Burton, Planning and Development Lead
<b>Ward:</b>	2

---

## **Discussion – Background and Current Status:**

The City has received a Land Use Assessment Report (LUAR) from John Hearn Architect Inc. and PARTISANS, on behalf of Sonco Group Inc. for the development of a 4-storey hotel above the Atlantic Place Parking Garage. The proposed development will also include a small retail area at the ground floor and renovations to the parking garage. The LUAR was a requirement of Council prior to consideration of a text amendment to the A. P. Parking Garage Zone to increase the maximum height from 11-storeys to 12-storeys.

The subject property is located in the A.P. Parking Garage District and Zone. The property is not located within the Heritage Area, however given its proximity to Heritage Area 1 and a number of designated Heritage Buildings, Council has referred the application to the Built Heritage Experts Panel (BHEP) to evaluate the design. Where the property is not in a Heritage Area, *Regulation 5.9.4 Heritage Area Standards (Table)* of the St. John's Development Regulations does not apply.

The existing parking garage is 8-storeys. The applicants are proposing to add an additional 4-storey hotel above the parking garage for a total of 12-storeys. Under the current zoning, the maximum height is 11-storeys, and a hotel located on the 9<sup>th</sup> and/or higher storeys is a discretionary use. A Municipal Plan and Development Regulations amendment is required to consider a 12-storey development.

The applicants have proposed a design to make the hotel portion distinguishable from the parking garage. In the LUAR, it is described as a composition of volumes, where the parking garage, hotel rooms, lobby and sauna area each are contained in distinguishable volume. The renovation will include wrapping that existing garage with a perforated, powder-coated white metal screen. Along the Harbour Drive side of the parking garage, the applicants are proposing to include a silhouette graphic of a supply vessel as a way to connect the Parkhotel to the harbour. The hotel portion is proposed to be powder-coated metal panels in various colours, with black spandrel (opaque) glass for the hotel rooms.

# ST. JOHN'S

At this stage, staff are reviewing the LUAR and have provided initial comments to the applicants. Once staff are satisfied with the LUAR, the application will be referred to a Public Meeting chaired by an independent facilitator. Any recommendations from the Panel will be forwarded to the applicants with the staff comments and will be included in the information forwarded to Council following the public meeting. As the LUAR is currently in draft form, it will be sent to the Panel under a separate cover.

**Key Considerations/Implications:**

1. Budget/Financial Implications: Not Applicable.
2. Partners or Other Stakeholders: Not Applicable.
3. Alignment with Strategic Directions/Adopted Plans:  
*A Sustainable City:* Plan for land use and preserve and enhance the natural and built environment where we live.
4. Legal or Policy Implications:  
An amendment to the St. John's Municipal Plan and Development Regulations is required.
5. Engagement and Communications Considerations: Not Applicable.
6. Human Resource Implications: Not Applicable.
7. Procurement Implications: Not Applicable.
8. Information Technology Implications: Not Applicable.
9. Other Implications: Not Applicable.

**Conclusion/Next Steps:**

Any recommendations from the Panel will be forwarded to the applicants with the staff comments and will be included in the information forwarded to Council following the public meeting.

**Prepared by/Signature:**

Ann-Marie Cashin, MCIP – Planner III, Urban Design and Heritage

Signature: \_\_\_\_\_

**Approved by/Date/Signature:**

Ken O'Brien, MCIP – Chief Municipal Planner

Signature: \_\_\_\_\_

AMC/dlm

**Attachments:** LUAR (sent under a separate cover)



# ST. JOHN'S

## Minutes of Built Heritage Experts Panel

**August 14, 2019**

**12:00 p.m.**

**Conference Room A, 4th Floor City Hall**

Present: Glenn Barnes, Chairperson  
Garnet Kindervater, Contractor  
Rachel Fitkowski, Landscape Architect  
Mark Whalen, Architecture  
Ken O'Brien, Chief Municipal Planner  
Ann Marie Cashin, Heritage and Urban Planner

Regrets: Bruce Blackwood, Contractor  
Dawn Boutilier, Planner  
Rob Schamper, Technical Advisor

Staff: Shanna Fitzgerald, Legislative Assistant

### **3. APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA**

**Moved By** Rachel Fitkowski

**Seconded By** Garnet Kindervater

That the agenda be adopted as presented.

**CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**

### **4. ADOPTION OF THE MINUTES**

#### **4.1 Minutes dated July 17, 2019**

**Moved By** Rachel Fitkowski

**Seconded By** Mark Whalen

That the minutes of the Built Heritage Experts Panel of July 17, 2019 be adopted as presented.

5. **BUSINESS ARISING FROM THE MINUTES**

5.1 **Information Note dated May 6, 2019 re: Door and Garage Door Styles in Heritage Areas**

This matter was deferred from the May 15, 2019 Built Heritage Experts Panel Meeting. The discussion and recommendations from the Panel will be used to inform a Decision Note on door and garage doors styles.

In numerous Built Heritage Experts Panel (BHEP) meetings, the topic of door and garage door styles has been raised. Staff currently use *The Heritage Look: Renovating Your Home* as a guide in determining appropriate door styles, however there are a variety of door and garage door styles available today that were not available in 1978 when the guide was first prepared by the St. John's Heritage Foundation. Therefore, staff are requesting the Panel's assistance in determining appropriate door and garage door styles for the three St. John's Heritage Areas.

Staff are currently drafting a Heritage Bylaw which will regulate the design of buildings in the St. John's Heritage Areas. Following adoption of the Heritage Bylaw, staff will prepare a series of information sheets for residents and applicants in the Heritage Area to clearly identify acceptable door and garage door styles.

The Panel reviewed the examples prepared in the presentation. All door styles were found in the different Heritage Areas. The intent of the presentation was to seek the Committee's direction on the door styles presented.

The Panel noted the following:

- Heritage Area 1: design should include more detailing around the doors.
- Panel recommends against varnishing wooden doors due to their likelihood to chip..
- The Panel would prefer more customization of doors as opposed to off the shelf standard models, particularly in Heritage Area 1.
- For those doors with glass, plain glass is preferred to frosted.

- In relation to storm doors, the Panel recommends full glass design to enable display of the interior door.

The presentation outlined various styles of doors and the following was noted by the Panel:

- 6 panel doors are acceptable as long as the guidelines are followed in relation to the application of trim work.
- 5/6 panel doors are the less common style and would no longer be available. In such cases, restoration would be recommended. Consideration would need to be made to matching the side panels.
- Oval doors could be replicated by some manufacturers and the under shelf (ledge) could be manufactured. 1/3 lower panel must be maintained.
- Glass oval inset doors will be allowed with the requirement that there must be 1/3 panel on bottom of door.
- The Panel would recommend against multiple vertical paneled doors with glass inset and one paneled doors.
- Half glass door variations are more traditional. The detail under the glass is easy to replicate.
- The Panel recommended against standard modern divided glass doors with applied grills as they are not traditional looking doors.
- True divided glass doors would be allowed (individual panes).
- 3/4 glass doors that are the modern version of heritage doors with what looks like leaded glass will be allowed.
- Max 2/3 glass doors will be allowed with recommendation for plain glass.
- Craftsman style doors are not recommended. There should be a requirement of having a minimum of 1/2 glass.
- Doors with top half moon (sunburst) window are not recommended.

The presentation reviewed various styles of garage doors and the following was noted:

- Multi panel garage doors were discussed by the Panel. Recommendations were made by the Panel that glass will be allowed in the upper panels without grilles.
- If there are hinge details (carriage style) the Panel recommends that the color is the same as the door.
- True flat panel garage doors will be allowed but with the recommendation it blends with the house.

The Heritage and Urban Planner, will bring forward a decision note outlining the directions discussed today at a future Built Heritage Experts Panel.

## 6. **NEW BUSINESS**

### 6.1 **Decision Note dated August 12, 2019 re: 119 Waterford Bridge Road**

The City received an application to designate 119 Waterford Bridge Road as a Heritage Building. The subject property is located in the Residential Low Density District of the St. John's Municipal Plan and is zoned Residential Low Density (R1). The property is not located in a Heritage Area.

Applicants recognize the historic significance of the structure, so the residents intend to maintain the existing architectural style. Renovations that have been approved to this point will be permitted.

Resident indicated original structure burned so this structure would be dated in the late 1880s.

The Panel suggested that a letter of congratulations be sent to the applicant on behalf of the Built Heritage Experts Panel.

**Moved By** Mark Whalen

**Seconded By** Garnet Kindervater

That Council designate 119 Waterford Bridge Road as a Heritage Building.

Should Council wish to proceed with heritage designation, Council may direct Legal to undertake a Designation By-law for consideration.

**CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**

7. **ADJOURNMENT**

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 1:36 pm.

---

GLENN BARNES, CHAIR