ST. JOHN'S

Minutes of Built Heritage Experts Panel

August 19, 2020
12:00 p.m.
Virtual

Present:	Glenn Barnes, Chairperson Bruce Blackwood, Contractor Garnet Kindervater, Contractor Rachel Fitkowski, Landscape Architect
Regrets:	Dawn Boutilier, Planner Mark Whalen, Architecture
Staff:	Ken O'Brien, Chief Municipal Planner Ann Marie Cashin, Heritage and Urban Planner Maureen Harvey, Legislative Assistant Kent Decker, Senior Building Inspector

1. CALL TO ORDER

2. APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA

Moved By Garnet Kindervater
Seconded By Bruce Blackwood

That the agenda be adopted as presented

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

3. ADOPTION OF THE MINUTES

3.1 Adoption of Minutes - May 27, 2020

Moved By Rachel Fitkowski
Seconded By Bruce Blackwood

That the minutes of the meeting held May 27, 2020 be adopted as presented.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

4. PRESENTATIONS/DELEGATIONS

4.1 331 Water Street, Fascia and Wall Signs, SGN2000051

The City received an application for fascia and wall signs at 331 Water Street. The subject property is located in Heritage Area 1, the Commercial Downtown District of the St. John's Municipal Plan and is zoned Commercial Central Retail (CCR). The building is under construction and is not a designated Heritage Building.

The sign application is brought to the Panel because the proposed signs exceed the maximum size set out in the Heritage Area Sign By-law. Pursuant to Section 20 of the By-law, the Heritage Advisory Committee may recommend to Council the acceptance of certain non-conforming signs whose particular design or situation merit such consideration and Council may accept or reject the recommendation, provided that the sign does not contravene the provisions of the St. John's Sign By-Law. Note, the proposed signage here does not contravene the Sign By-Law.

The attached renderings include signs for BMO (the Bank of Montreal) and for a future main tenant and other tenant. However, the applicant has indicated that they are seeking approval only for the four BMO signs at this time. Once the other tenants are confirmed, they will seek a separate sign approval at that time.

Francisc Templer attended the meeting as the delegation to present his proposal for signage on the BMO building on Water Street.

Discussion took place with the following recommendation brought forward:

Recommendation
Moved By Garnet Kindervater
Seconded By Bruce Blackwood

That Council approve all four signs numbered as S1, S2, S3 and S4, on the attached renderings and further that the proposed "Major Tenant"

signs (S10, S11 and S12), once applications have been submitted, be relocated to the area below the 2nd storey of the building. Should the signs exceed the guidelines of the Heritage Area Sign By-law, they must be brought back to the Panel for further consideration."

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

4.2 172 Campbell Avenue, Heritage Designation

The City received an application to designate the building at 172 Campbell Avenue as a Heritage Building. The subject property is located outside of the St. John's Heritage Areas, is designated Residential Medium Density under the St. John's Municipal Plan and is zoned Residential Medium Density (R2). Should Council designate the building as a Heritage Building, discretionary uses in the R2 Zone include Heritage Use.

Discussion took place with staff providing a history of the building. It was agreed that if designated by Council and the use of the building changes, it would require further review by the City.

Moved By Bruce Blackwood
Seconded By Garnet Kindervater

Council approve the proposed heritage designation of 172 Campbell Avenue as presented and as supported by the NL Historic Trust and the Status of Women's Council.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

5. BUSINESS ARISING FROM THE MINUTES

6. NEW BUSINESS

6.1 Metal Roofs in Heritage Areas

The City has received a request from a property owner to consider more than shingle-style metal roofs on residential buildings; see the attached memo. The owner would like to replace scalloped shingles on a mansard roof with a batten-seam metal roof. They claim that batten-seam metal is the only heritage-appropriate, visually attractive, long-lasting, and achievable solution for their mansard repair. To date, an application for renovations at the subject property has not been received.

Staff did, however, reminded the Panel of its position of last year as follows;

That the following apply to the use of modern roof materials in heritage areas:

- Shingle-style metal roofs for residential dwellings will be permitted subject to the material replicating heritage style. Non-residential buildings may be permitted other styles of metal roofs if the style replicates the existing roof style.
- Solar Panels will be permitted as long as they are not visible from the street.

Moved By Bruce Blackwood
Seconded By Rachel Fitkowski

That Council reject the assertion that a batten-seam roof is the most appropriate material to use in residential buildings of heritage areas and stand by its position of 2019 as follows:

That the following apply to the use of modern roof materials in heritage areas:

- Shingle-style metal roofs for residential dwellings will be permitted subject to the material replicating heritage style. Non-residential buildings may be permitted other styles of metal roofs if the style replicates the existing roof style.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

7. ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 1:20 pm

_____

GLENN BARNES, CHAIR